



e.Forum Posit

Posit: Given that we each have a constitutional right to life and the pursuit of happiness; and in that pursuit we inevitably use up, wear out, and risk our own bodies, therefore: "We should be free to sell an organ for profit."

RESULTS: Among 123 responses, the majority disagreed. (agree: 25; disagree: 92; no opinion: 6) Edited comments from 24 members follow.

"We already 'sell organs' at the present time. When individuals are paid in money or in kind for their 'donations' it is a trade of sorts. In the matter of organ transplantation/donation, the one in ultimate control would be the donor. Regulation of the free consent to donate and the safety of the donation as well as the life of the donor should be looked after. This would legitimize such transactions and prevent harm to the individuals involved. See abortions." - Jose Ma C. Leuterio, MD

"This is not just an issue of personal choice. This is an ethical issue and, as such, there are issues such as dealing with the greater good." - J. Rabinovitz, MD

"I think that organs are sacred instruments. However, one should be able to sell a piano at a profit." - Tom Wilkes, MD

"If a recipient had to pay the highest price for a donated organ, only the affluent would receive them instead of those with the greatest medical need." - Allan H. Galbreath, MD

"I don't believe there should be financial incentive to donate organs." - Irma West, MD

"Would those who disagree argue some virtue in depriving others of the ownership rights to their our own bodies" - L. Welter, MD

"It shouldn't be necessary or permitted." - Elaine Silver, MD

"You can sell my organ for whatever you can get for it, but if you charge by the inch, it's not going to be much money." - Greg Herrera, MD

"Two issues lead me to say that selling an organ for profit is not something that should be considered part of the right to life and the pursuit of happiness. The first is that it is too likely that selling an organ for profit would make truly informed consent to such an elective and not medically indicated procedure nearly impossible. Secondly, our society chooses to put limits on some types of behaviors for the good of individuals whether the individual wants it or not, such as helmets on motorcycle riders." - Marlene Mirassou, MD

"Speaking from a private religious sense, our bodies really don't belong to us." - Joseph Lash, MD

"It begins the slippery slope of being involuntary. True liberty means freedom from coercion. We would be naive to think that no one (or even only a small number) would be coerced to risk their own health for the financial gain of others." - Richard Pan, MD

"I agree given the donor is an adult and mentally competent." - R. Treat, MD

"I just don't think it is ethical and sale of organs could be used illegally, would be a great scam for organized crime. In the past, people sold their blood, but this was stopped, probably for the same reasons." - James Margolis, MD

"There may come a time in my life when the outlook is not good. It would mean a lot to me to be able to give back to the human race a piece of me that will help someone else. I see no problem with accepting money to help my family in times like this." - Ron Rogers, MD

"When anyone can sell an organ, only the most desperate will do so, and be willing to gamble with their own lives for money. The economically secure will never do so. We have done poorly enough by own least fortunate citizens, without giving them the 'freedom' to risk their lives and health for the sake of economic security. If we are a humane society, we should find a way to give them that security in a less barbaric way." - Francisco Prieto, MD

"Our society already gives financial rewards for 'hazardous duty' to many who risk their bodies, such as firefighters, police and soldiers. Why not organ donors?" - Anthony Deriggi, MD

"I agree with the premise but not the conclusion. The risk-reward balance would significantly shift the risk of organ donation onto the poor. That is, the medical risk is more or less the same for all, but the financial gain may be relatively substantial to someone of little means yet insignificant to someone of wealth. Thus, only the poor would find it reasonable to risk their life for a fee. This would likely have a negative impact on organ donation overall as something people do out of desperation rather than generosity." - Mark F. Moeller, MS IV

"Does every transaction always have to have a profit motive? Wasn't medicine a noble calling at one time?" - Craig Yamada, MD

"Just does not feel right." - Bryant Sheehy, MD

"Some values supersede others." - Amy Harley, MSIII

"I don't think selling organs is a good idea. Would it be OK to sell babies that one has borne 'for profit'? Wait, I think that is happening already. What about convicted prisoners, especially those on death row? Who would get the money - the prisoner, the state, the family of the prisoner, or the victim of the crime? Wait, I heard that is happening already in China where they have mobile execution vans and the prisoners bodies are whisked away." - A. Czerwinski, MD

"If someone wants to donate an organ and want money for it I do not think it is wrong; but for profit? That's cheesy. It is a sacrifice of both one's life and time from one's own duty /work/family and to get some remuneration from that is only fair and that too only if the donor requests it and is within reasonable limits." - Elizabeth Mathew, MD

"I don't believe there should be financial incentive to donate organs." - Ronald Cole, MD
